

**LANDMARK COMMISSION
MINUTES
August 26, 2025**

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Christy Graham
Joel Hartmangruber
JD Dixon
Bill Enlow
Noros Martin
Janel Ponder Smith
John Yates

■ Chairperson
■ Vice-Chair
■ Member
■ Member
■ Member
■ Member
■ Member

Terry Floyd, Director of Development
Monica Aguon, Deputy City Attorney
Robin Marshall, Admin. Assistant, Dev't Services Dept.
Karen Montgomery-Gagné, Principal Planner/HPO

■ City Staff
■ City Staff
■ City Staff
■ City Staff

ABSENT:

Dr. Dawn Ferrell, Maj. Gen.(retired)
John Dickinson
Whitney Flack

■ Member
■ Member
■ Council Liaison

GUESTS:

Scott Todd, Applicant/Owner
Alex Graves, Maxim Construction Group (Arlington)

■ 1401 Garfield
■ 1401 Garfield

I. Call to Order, Introductions and Welcome:

Chairperson Christy Graham called the meeting to order at 11:59 am.
Ms. Graham welcomed guests and Commission members provided introductions.

II. Review & Approval of Minutes from June 24, 2025:

Chairperson Graham called for review and approval of the June 24, 2025, Landmark Commission meeting minutes. Mr. Noros Martin made a motion to approve the minutes as presented; Ms. Janel Ponder Smith seconded the motion. Chairperson Graham took the motion to vote, and it was unanimously approved. 7-0

III. Action Item: Design Review Case – 1401 Garfield:

Request authorization for alternate roofing materials; replace asphalt shingled roof/underlayment with Decra stone coated architectural metal roofing system along with new underlayment, ridge cap, and flashing. (West Floral Heights HD)
Applicants: Scott and Laura Todd

Ms. Montgomery-Gagné presented the case and stated this is one of the prominent

properties in the West Floral Heights Historic District, located at the corner of 10th and Garfield. The home is a classic Prairie architectural style contributing to the district. It was built in 1922 and is relatively unchanged. It was noted the home has a low pitch roof. Some of the unique details of the house are the horizontal siding on the first floor and shingle-based material on the second floor. She stated the front covered entry had a special design, with three columns on each front corner. Staff showed various inventory photos of the property. In a 2013 photo, the composition shingle roof was shown, and then a 2019 photo showed the difference in the roof, basically only by the color of the shingles. She informed the Board there was an administrative approval for the replacement roof because it was same style material as existing, including same texture, slope and pitch. Additional photos were shown depicting the connection with the breezeway between the main house and an accessory structure (to the south). Staff referenced a prior design case at 1401 Garfield authorized by the Commission for replacement windows; aluminum-clad wood windows.

Noting spring storms the area experienced this year, it was said that a lot of residents are having to replace impact resistant roofs (Class 4 shingles) based on insurance claims. The current roof is an impact resistant roof, and Mr. Todd is wanting something with more long-term durability that can withstand local storm weather, and to ensure longevity of the home by reducing water impacts. Mr. Todd researched a new product – stone coated metal shingles and believes it is something he would like to consider using, so, he came forward with the request for the Commission to consider a Decra stone-coated metal shingle for 1401 Garfield. Additional photos of the home were shown so the Commission could see the current conditions and to help better understand the extent of the areas that would be potentially covered with the alternate roofing material. The main reason the owner is requesting to use a metal shingle is to reduce: 1) additional weather damage/water leaks, and 2) increase the material longevity to avoid continual cycles of roof replacement.

Ms. Montgomery-Gagné said this case was presented to the Landmark appointed Volunteer Neighborhood Design Review Committee. They met with Mr. Todd, and recommended this alternate roof material as an acceptable substitute material and indicated no objection to moving forward. The committee is reactivating, thanks to Janel and other volunteers, so they can provide the Commission with comments and feedback from a neighborhood level. It was noted, this case will not set precedent within West Floral Heights Historic District. In 2024, a case at 1600 Tilden was approved for a similar style material, Decra stone-coated tile version of the product to replace a very damaged Ludowici original tile roof that had global damage throughout. The owners went through a 3–4-year battle with their insurance company in order to have the entire roof replaced not just sections. The owners didn't have the \$200,000 to replace the Ludowici tile roof, because insurance was not going to cover full cost of replacement. Additional photos and specifications of the proposed tile were shown, as well as actual samples of the product. The Decra product that would be used for the project comes in panels, approx. 4ft by 1ft that have an interlocking system, and the color will be Midnight Eclipse. The Decra stone-coated metal shingles have a lifetime, 50-year transferable warranty.

A concern when the Decra product was considered for 1600 Tilden was how it was viewed by the Texas Historical Commission, and how it fits the national guidelines -

Secretary of the Interior Standards. It was mentioned a case study in Texas involved renovations at the Dr. Pepper Museum, where the State Historic Preservation Office authorized the Decra stone-coated metal tiles as an acceptable substitute (no adverse impact) for the original tile roof destroyed many decades prior. It was found the Decra product would be an acceptable alternative because it addressed weather conditions, accommodated elaborate roofing systems, it was lightweight and it replicated the original style with deep texturing.

Staff noted from national standards to our local design guidelines, it was important for the Commission to determine if the alternate product was appropriate. When considering if substitute materials would be appropriate, it's important to ensure the building materials will have the potential to match the appearance, physical properties, and any related attributes of historic materials, well enough to make them alternatives for current preservation practice. We believe the Decra stone coated material gives longevity but also helps maintain the appearance and the physical properties of the composition shingles that have been traditionally used on this house. Ms. Montgomery-Gagné stated that our local guidelines under the roofing section, recommend roofing materials that duplicate appearance and profile of original materials as a goal. If replacement is indeed necessary, replace only the elements deteriorated beyond repair.

Staff researched use of Decra product in Texas where the state had determined it's an acceptable substitute material, looking at how it fits with the national standards and then how it fits with our design guidelines. We believe the Decra Stone coated shingle would be an accepted substitute material based on keeping with design, profile and visual qualities. Chairperson Graham asked if the applicant or the contractor would like to add any comments. The contractor (Mr. Alex Graves) spoke and pointed out the Decra system creates an envelope around the structure with a locking key system. Every panel locks with the one beneath it. They are installed from left to right and there is about a four-inch overlay on every panel where the same fastener goes through two panels. The seal that's created is unbreakable. Mr. Graves did point out to the Commission that if a branch fell on the roof and just damaged a certain area, the system is serviceable and those panels could be replaced without having to completely reroof.

The owner, Mr. Todd, said a few words describing the state of the house and that he is just trying to take care of it as the cost of getting a new roof due to ongoing storm damage continues to rise. He believes Decra stone-coated metal tile product will be a financially better solution due to its warranty, more durable material and resemblance to composition shingles.

Staff noted comments were submitted from an absent board member, Dr. Farrell, and read her statement indicating she liked the appearance and is of the believe the proposed materials for the roof would be acceptable in comparison to textured composition shingles. Dr. Farrell did have some comments about color of the roof, i.e., does it match the house, and if it fits in with the rest of the district and then maintaining the shape and slope of the original roof. Chairperson Graham asked if anyone from the audience wished to make any comments. The color options were discussed, and it was noted colors are not something that fall under review of the Board. There were no additional comments or questions from the public. Mr. Joel Hartmangruber made a motion to approve the design

review case for alternate roofing material (Decra stone-coated metal roofing shingles) as presented. Ms. Janel Ponder-Smith seconded the motion. There being no other public comment, Chairperson Graham took the motion to a vote, passing 7-0.

IV. Other Business:

Depot Square Update:

Given by Chairperson Graham who highlighted National Texoma Gives Day (Sept 4), upcoming productions at Wichita Theatre, Backdoor Theatre and special events at the Farmers Market. She highlighted the Hotter'N Hell Hundred events had a great turnout. In addition, O.G. Cellars, 6th Street Winery and Wichita Brewery usually have entertainment on Friday or Saturday nights. A design review update: Wichita Brewery stairs/landing installed, though 2nd story door not in place. Finally, Inman Construction building (500 10th St) near the railroad tracks (behind Brian's Plumbing) was saved, and Anthony did a beautiful restoration.

West Floral Heights:

Given by Janel Ponder-Smith

- West Floral Heights Homeowner's Neighborhood Association is a 501C3 Non-profit if anyone wants to give during Texoma Gives, to help us pay for new sidewalks.
- Ice Cream Social Event - Sept. 7th; Wine Tasting (WFH Association) – Oct. 14th.
- Printing brochure for every household and building owners to keep up with things the Association is trying accomplish in the neighborhood; new bylaws passed in 20024.

Commission/Staff Updates:

Given by Ms. Montgomery-Gagné

- The Commission was notified of a Section 106 review for property in 5000 block of Jacksboro Highway for removal of telecommunication tower equipment and adding C-band equipment, so there will be no impact on the ground. No additional tower will be added; it will just be a modification to an existing tower. This was deemed to be minimal to no impact as far as historic resources.
- NAPC training webinar in September; encouraged Commissioners to access info.
- THC *The Medallion* Summer Issue - Texas First Street Initiative program which encourages communities to look at an avenue toward Main Street without the same costs/staff stipulations. As City Council and the Chamber move forward with strategies for downtown, we hope the program can be considered in the future.

Staff Administrative Design Reviews:

Staff referred members to their agenda that outlined various minor alterations approved administratively. Majority of approvals related to replacement roofs – same materials.

V. Adjourn:

Chairperson Graham adjourned the meeting at 12:41 pm and stated next scheduled meeting would be September 23, 2025, at 12:00 pm.


Christy Graham, Chairperson


Date